



CRI(2018)26

# ANNUAL REPORT ON ECRI'S ACTIVITIES

covering the period from 1 January to 31 December 2017

Visit our website: www.coe.int/ecri

ECRI Secretariat Directorate General II - Democracy Council of Europe F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex Tel.: +33 (0)3 90 21 46 62

Strasbourg, June 2018

Preface	5
Main trends	7
ECRI's activities in 2017	- 15
1. Country-by-country approach	- 15
2. Work on general themes	- 17
3. Relations with civil society	- 18
4. Cooperation with Equality Bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination	- 19
5. Other activities	- 20
6. Communication strategy	- 21
Co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations	- 23
Appendix I – Membership of ECRI	- 29
Appendix II – Secretariat of ECRI	- 37
Appendix III - Meetings held by ECRI in 2017	- 39
Appendix IV - List of publications	- 43

# **Preface**

The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) is a mechanism which was established by the first Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe member states. The decision to establish ECRI is contained in the Vienna Declaration adopted by the first Summit on 9 October 1993. On 13 June 2002, the Committee of Ministers adopted an autonomous Statute for ECRI and thus consolidated its role as an independent human rights monitoring mechanism specialised in questions relating to racism and intolerance.

ECRI's task is to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at the level of greater Europe and from the perspective of the protection of human rights. ECRI's action covers all necessary measures to combat violence, discrimination and prejudice faced by persons or groups of persons, on grounds of "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin.

ECRI's members are appointed on the basis of their in-depth knowledge in the field of combating intolerance. They should have high moral authority and recognised expertise in dealing with racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance. They serve in their individual capacity, are independent and impartial in fulfilling their mandate, and do not receive any instructions from their government.

ECRI's statutory activities are: country monitoring; work on general themes; and relations with civil society. ECRI's strategy for constantly enhancing its activities is to take a step-by-step approach, building on the work it has already accomplished by evaluating, consolidating and extending its action.

# Main trends

### Introduction

- 1. Approaching the end of its fifth monitoring cycle which started in 2013, it is time for ECRI to take stock of its findings in the country reports adopted so far. While these reports largely focused on the main topics of the current cycle: i.e., national legislation against racism and racial discrimination, racist and homo/transphobic hate speech and violence, as well as integration policies, they also covered a certain number of country specific topics, including discrimination against LGBT persons.
- 2. ECRI is pleased to observe some positive developments in member states. For example, hate crime and anti-discrimination legislation is now in place in most countries and equality bodies, which are expressly entrusted with the fight against racism and racial discrimination, have been established at national level in almost all member states. In a growing number of countries, comprehensive action plans against racism and integration strategies for Roma and non-nationals are being implemented. Moreover, ECRI's General Policy Recommendations (GPRs) provide detailed guidelines for policy-makers in a variety of fields and are increasingly used by members states; ECRI's recent GPR No.15 on combating hate speech, for example, has already reached a wide audience, including national governments and the EU.
- 3. Each year, as an introduction to its annual report, ECRI outlines the main trends in the fields of racism<sup>1</sup>, racial discrimination<sup>2</sup>, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance in Europe. The purpose of this exercise is to show the context in which ECRI must continue its efforts and step up its action in the future. The precise characteristics and extent of these trends, observed in the

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> According to ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No.7, racism is the belief that a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin justifies contempt for a person or a group of persons, or the notion of superiority of a person or a group of persons.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> According to ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No.7, racial discrimination is any differential treatment based on a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin, which has no objective and reasonable justification.

course of ECRI's various activities, differ from region to region and country to country. They are, however, sufficiently widespread to justify a special mention.

# Xenophobic populism and hate speech<sup>3</sup>

- 4. As in previous years, 2017 has witnessed a rise in fear and resentment in European societies, largely due to high levels of migration, religious extremism, and terrorist attacks. The austeritydriven socio-economic climate has exacerbated these sentiments, leading to a rise in populism in Europe. While populism is a complex phenomenon, in which security concerns also play a role, the rhetoric has blended continuously into an actual or constructed hatred of non-nationals or minorities. The era of security threats also brings with it a move to normalise the state of emergency in some countries. Worse, these concerns have been exploited to justify huge trade-offs in fundamental rights of migrants and other vulnerable groups. In several countries, there is a trend to multiculturalism as a dangerous notion and to pursue a pattern that seems to negate and deny the value of human rights and their universality. This trend can fundamentally damage social cohesion and incite committing acts of hostility, discrimination, hate speech or even violence.
- 5. Against this background, ECRI considers that kaleidoscope of politics is changing and that combating racial discrimination, xenophobia and related forms of intolerance is more relevant than ever. Reversing the contemporary wave of xenophobic populism primarily requires dedicated efforts to counter increasing hate speech in different fora. In many of its country reports, ECRI has observed that social media and other Internet tools encourage self-segregation and deepen social divides. Similarly, a considerable number of media outlets either knowingly or unintentionally spread xenophobic rhetoric. These new dimensions and venues of hate speech necessitate new forms of response and states must not only take legislative measures against the use of hate speech, but also measures addressing the conditions conducive to its use, as these are more likely to prove effective in ultimately eradicating it. ECRI's reports have revealed that implementing more dedicated and tailored

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> For a definition of hate speech, please refer to ECRI's GPR No. 15 on combating hate speech.

programmes in the education system, for example integrating human rights education into school curricula, can accelerate progress in promoting a responsible use of the Internet especially by the young generation.

Furthermore, in several country reports, ECRI has observed 6. that actively engaging members of political, religious and cultural elites, including artists or sport celebrities, in counter-speech is instrumental in reversing the hate message. Similarly, establishing between synergies different actors. such as international organisations and the private sector may result in finding sustainable solutions to the challenges of racist hate speech. ECRI continues to advocate for the full utilisation of its GPR No. 15 on combating hate speech and encourages governments to review their legislation and policies in this regard.

# Equality Bodies⁴

- 7. Equality bodies are vital for advancing equality. Tasked to perform a wide range of functions, they play a pivotal role in promoting equality and supporting people exposed to discrimination and intolerance. Over the years, a rich and diverse system of equality bodies has emerged across member states and many good practices have been developed. However, ECRI's reports have continued to show that barriers to their effective functioning still exist and some of these equality bodies suffer problems, in particular with regard to their independence and funding.
- In addition to its long-lasting cooperation with equality bodies 8. through its annual seminars, in 2017, ECRI has highlighted the valuable pioneering work that these bodies carry out and revised its GPR No. 2 on equality bodies to combat racism and intolerance at national level. This revision builds on the findings recommendations in ECRI's monitoring reports. It contains comprehensive standards to help member states to further strengthen their equality bodies. While focusing on the key elements for their establishment, independence and effective functioning, the revised GPR No. 2 emphasises the importance of providing equality bodies with the necessary powers and sufficient resources to fully execute their mandate with real impact.

<sup>4</sup> The term "national specialised bodies" was updated to "equality bodies" in the revised version of GPR No. 2 which was published on 27 February 2018.

### Integration

- Migrants, refugees and beneficiaries of subsidiary protection
- Managing migration while respecting human obligations has remained a major challenge in many member states. Migration has continued to be represented by xenophobic populist circles as a threat to social cohesion and security. This discourse often overlooks the evidence-based facts about migration. Despite this trend, ECRI has observed that several countries have vigorously invested efforts into facilitating the integration of migrants who have a right to remain in the country, mainly refugees and beneficiaries of subsidiary protection. A large spectrum of measures has been taken in particular in the areas of housing, education and employment. Still, the general approach has mostly been limited to migration control. Albeit the number of migrants has an obvious impact on the absorption capacity of countries, this focus risks stalling or even undermining integration efforts. Indeed, ECRI's reports have shown that legal restrictions, for example on family reunification of beneficiaries of subsidiary protection, have a disproportionately negative impact on these vulnerable people and hinder successful integration. Furthermore, such policies may increase extremism within the receiving society. Therefore, across Europe, there is a need to adopt more inclusive migration policies which provide dignified support to migrants. While acknowledging the challenges of migration, ECRI encourages changing the narrative to a more balanced and fact-based discourse that emphasises the positive contribution of well-governed migration, in particular by underlining the opportunities and resources migrants can bring.
- 10. Although fear-driven populism has widened the gap between the perception and the reality of migration and reinforced stereotypes and misconceptions about migrants, 2017 has also witnessed an increasing solidarity among citizens and civil society groups in responding to the attitude of states. Several initiatives in different forms, such as awareness-raising campaigns and tailored projects, have been taken, particularly at local level. Based in the town or in the village, these local integration measures often achieve better outcomes than overly centralised ones. They particularly have a potential to create a genuine dialogue between the groups to be integrated and the local population, helping the parties to get to know each other and be part of their own solution.

### - Roma and Travellers

- 11. Roma and Travellers continue to experience severe discrimination as a result of persisting barriers to education, employment, housing and health services. Their situation remains characterised by a high level of social exclusion which is nurtured by perpetual prejudice, stigmatisation, hate speech, exploitation and violence. ECRI's reports have shown that Roma girls and women are particularly vulnerable to inadequate access to their basic rights, education in particular, due to the intersectionality of ethnicity, gender and social class inequalities.
- Although many European countries have adopted national strategies, programmes and action plans for Roma integration, their implementation remains insufficient. Goals are often not attained owing to scarce financial resources and lack of involvement of the relevant authorities, as well as Roma communities themselves, in the development and implementation. The absence of quality data concerning the size of the Roma population and their living conditions in member states also constitutes a significant difficulty. However, efforts towards the social inclusion of Roma have borne some positive results as well. In several country reports, ECRI has observed that the authorities have made progress in the educational inclusion of Roma children through different measures, including the introduction of free pre-school education with an emphasis on language learning and programmes preventing school-absenteeism as well as early school drop-out. ECRI has continued to remind authorities of its GPR No. 13 on combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma.

#### Minorities

13. Depending on the political approach which is often linked to longstanding conceptions on national identity, the policies towards minorities among member states vary substantially. In several reports, ECRI has pointed out that commemoration events primarily in post-conflict countries, which symbolise a traumatic history for certain minorities, can in some cases lead to social fragmentation and diminishing cohesion, which eventually contributes to racism, racial hatred and discrimination. In spite of the diversity of the situation, ECRI's findings have revealed some good practices aiming at ending social marginalisation of minorities. For instance, in some member states, the authorities have successfully adopted positive

measures with a view to increasing their participation in the labour market. In 2017, ECRI has continued its close cooperation with the Council of Europe's Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities.

### Islamophobia

- 14. Anti-Muslim rhetoric has persisted in many member states during the year. Islam has continued to be seen as a peril and portrayed by xenophobic populists as a religion prone to violence and terrorism, a stigma that can trigger intolerant attitudes amongst some non-Muslims and fuels fear and anger. This negative stereotyping has led to an increase in Islamophobic incidents, including hate speech and violence against Muslims and their institutions as well as widespread discrimination. Particularly in the framework of election campaigns, certain populist politicians have unleashed hatred towards Muslims by taking advantage of the concerns raised by the large movement of migrants. Islamophobia and its articulation have gradually become acceptable in the public opinion and media in a growing number of countries.
- 15. ECRI's reports have recalled the importance of establishing a real dialogue with Muslim communities and taking measures to debate the image of Islam and Muslim communities conveyed to the public. To this end, ECRI has encouraged governments to implement the recommendations contained in its <a href="GPR No.5">GPR No.5</a> on combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims and <a href="No.15">No. 15</a> on combating hate speech.

### Antisemitism

16. The situation for Jewish people in Europe has not substantially improved during 2017. Antisemitic hatred, often expressed through insults, threats, vandalism of synagogues or Jewish cemeteries and violence against Jewish persons was still widespread. As in previous years, protests against Israel often turned into general antisemitic rhetoric and generated calls for violence against all Jews. While some political leaders spoke out strongly against such hatred, there has been too little public outcry about the persistence of antisemitism. On the contrary, hatred against Jews has become an accepted "normality" in many European societies and a worrying complacency can be observed.

17. Given the fact that many newly-arrived migrants in Europe originate from countries where public discourse is often dominated by antisemitic prejudices (especially in the Middle East), a question of particular sensitivity is the issue of including awareness-raising about antisemitism in integration courses without producing negative stereotypes about migrants. The suggestion to create specific government focal-points for the fight against antisemitism (as has been recommended also by the OSCE and the EU Parliament) was made in some countries. Furthermore, ECRI has continued to invite governments to take inspiration from its GPR No. 9 on the fight against antisemitism.

### Anti-Black racism

18. The problems faced by Black communities and people of African descent across Europe and described by ECRI in its previous Annual Reports persist and little progress has been made in this area. While community groups as well as national and European networks of People of African Descent are increasingly active in documenting anti-Black discrimination, hate speech and violence, these civil society groups also point to very low levels of responsiveness among many governments when it comes to addressing these issues. During its monitoring visits, ECRI has further noted that in several Council of Europe member States there were not only very few activities organised by the authorities as part of the UN-initiated International Decade for People of African Descent (2015-2024), but often this initiative was not even known.

## Homo- and Transphobia

- 19. While Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender (LGBT) persons enjoy greater protection in many member states than ever before, in others they still struggle to fully exercise their human rights in environments where homophobia and transphobia persist. For example, 2017 has been marked with several worrying incidents in some countries, such as mass illegal detentions of LGBT persons, police raids on LGBT-friendly venues and restrictions on freedom of assembly. Similarly, homo-and transphobic hatred is still prevalent, particularly on the Internet and in social media, which have helped fuel a rise in hostility towards these groups.
- 20. Nevertheless, some progress has been made to reverse this picture. In several member states, ECRI has observed notable efforts to establish close cooperation between state authorities,

especially law enforcement bodies, and members of LGBT communities, particularly with a view to preventing and effectively investigating hate crimes. These efforts have yielded some promising results in enhancing trust in the institutions and developing a positive perception of LGBT persons among the public. ECRI reports have also noted that integrating awareness-raising into school curricula can make a significant difference in promoting tolerance in society.

### The European Convention on Human Rights

- 21. Protocol No. 12, which supplements the European Convention on Human Rights by prohibiting discrimination in general, has been ratified by 20 of the 47 member States of the Council of Europe, the most recent ratification being by Portugal in January 2017. ECRI will continue to recommend its ratification in the course of its country monitoring.
- 22. ECRI is pleased to note that its standards and country findings continue to be referred to by the European Court of Human Rights in its judgments. In 2017 the Court cited ECRI's work in the following judgments: In 2017, the Court cited ECRI's work in the following judgments: Grigoryan and Sergeyeva v. Ukraine, (Application no. 63409/11), 28 March 2017; Adyan and others v. Armenia, (Application no. 75604/11), 12 October 2017; Garib v. the Netherlands, (Application no. 43494/09), Grand Chamber Judgment, 6 November 2017 (Dissenting opinion of Judge Pinto de Albuquerque joined by Judge Vehabović).

# ECRI's activities in 2017

## 1. Country-by-country approach

- 23. ECRI's statutory activities comprise firstly country monitoring work. ECRI closely examines the situation in each of the member States of the Council of Europe and draws up suggestions and proposals as to how the problems it has identified might be overcome. The aim is to formulate helpful and well-founded recommendations, which may assist governments in taking concrete and practical steps to counter racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance.
- 24. ECRI's reports are first sent in draft form to the member States concerned for confidential dialogue. Their contents are reviewed in light of the national authorities' comments. They are then finally adopted and transmitted to the governments of the member States concerned, through the intermediary of the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers.
- 25. ECRI's country-by-country approach concerns all Council of Europe member States on an equal footing. The reports for the first round were completed in late 1998. From January 1999 to the end of December 2002, ECRI worked on the second round of its countryby-country approach. From January 2003 to the end of December 2007, ECRI worked on the third round of its country-by-country approach. ECRI started its fourth round of reporting in 2008. This round differs from the previous ones in that it introduced the interim follow-up mechanism: ECRI requested priority implementation for up to three recommendations and asked the member State concerned to provide information in this connection within two years from publication of the report. In 2017, ECRI published its conclusions on the implementation of the priority recommendations it had made in fourth round reports published in 2014, namely on Romania and Slovenia.
- 26. ECRI began its fifth round of country monitoring in 2013. This focuses on certain topics for in-depth analysis in all member States: legislative issues, hate speech, racist and homo/transphobic violence and integration policies. In addition, each report will deal with a certain number of topics specific to each country. These will address any other major "racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia,

antisemitism or intolerance" issues in the country concerned. Interim recommendations not implemented or only partially implemented during the fourth cycle will be followed-up as well. Finally, under its mandate to monitor intolerance against vulnerable groups, ECRI may address discrimination against LGBT communities in the section on country-specific issues. In 2017, ECRI published the first set of conclusions on the implementation of the priority recommendations it had made in its first fifth round reports, published in 2014, namely on Belgium, Bulgaria, Germany, the Slovak Republic and Switzerland.

- 27. In order to obtain as full a picture as possible, a contact visit is organised before the drafting of each new report. The visits provide an opportunity for ECRI Rapporteurs to meet officials from the various ministries and public authorities dealing with issues within ECRI's remit. They also allow Rapporteurs to meet representatives of NGOs working in the field, as well as independent experts and other persons concerned by the fight against racism and intolerance.
- 28. In 2017, ECRI published eight fifth-round country monitoring reports on Andorra, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Denmark, Iceland, Luxembourg, Montenegro, Serbia and Ukraine.
- 29. All reports published in 2017 have been translated into the national language(s) of the country concerned and steps have been taken to ensure that they are circulated as widely as possible among stakeholders at domestic level.
- 30. ECRI's reports received considerable media coverage. Reactions to these reports show how topical the issues discussed therein are and how urgent it is to ensure follow-up to their recommendations.
- 31. In 2017 ECRI carried out nine contact visits in Croatia, Latvia, Liechtenstein, Malta, Moldova, Portugal, San Marino, Spain and Sweden.
- 32. In 2017, ECRI began work to prepare its 6<sup>th</sup> cycle of country monitoring work. At its 74<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting held on 5-8 December, ECRI examined a draft information document on the sixth monitoring cycle prepared by the Bureau and instructed its Bureau to prepare a revised version of the document for its next plenary meeting in March 2018.

.....

33. To be able to maintain this rhythm of visits and the quality of the work that is expected of it under its Statute, ECRI needs a Secretariat with sufficient resources and expertise.

### 2. Work on general themes

General Policy Recommendations

- 34. ECRI's General Policy Recommendations, the second part of its statutory activities, are addressed to the governments of all member States; they cover important areas of current concern in the fight against racism and intolerance. They are intended to serve as guidelines for policy-makers when drawing up national strategies, programmes and projects.
- 35. In 2017, ECRI finalised its work on the revision of its General Policy Recommendation (GPR) No. 2 and adopted the revised GPR No. 2 on Equality Bodies<sup>5</sup> to combat racism and intolerance at national level, as well as the Explanatory Memorandum, at its 74<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting on 5-8 December. This new version of GPR No. 2 on Equality Bodies draws on best practices and contains standards to help member states to further strengthen their equality bodies, which are vital for advancing equality and for eliminating racism and violence in a sustained manner. While focusing on the key elements for their establishment, independence and effective functioning, the revised GPR No. 2 emphasises the importance of ensuring equality bodies fully execute their two essential functions: to promote equality and prevent discrimination and to support people exposed to discrimination and intolerance and to pursue litigation on their behalf.
- 36. In 2017, ECRI contributed to and participated in several conferences and seminars focusing on hate speech, thus emphasising the continuing relevance and usefulness of its GPR No. 15 on combating hate speech published on 21 March 2016, which are detailed under the sections "other activities" and ""cooperation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations" below.

<sup>5</sup> The term "national specialised bodies" was updated with "equality bodies" in the revised version of GPR No. 2 which was published on 27 February 2018.

\_\_\_\_\_

- 37. ECRI also organised a stakeholder meeting, in co-operation with the Platform for International Cooperation on Undocumented Migrants (PICUM), on 26 October 2017 to present its <a href="GPR No. 16">GPR No. 16</a> on safeguarding irregularly present migrants from discrimination, and to discuss its concrete implementation. The event brought together a broad range of stakeholders, including government representatives from European Union and Council of Europe member states, international organisations, institutional actors, academics and civil society.
- 38. During the year, ECRI launched and distributed six abridged versions of ECRI GPR Nos. 5, 9, 10, 11, 15 and 16 in both official languages and translated some of them into other European languages for specific events. These versions contain the key points and are presented in an attractive format, for use by the general public. It also began work on the preparation of abridged versions of GPR Nos. 2 (revised), 3, 13 and 14 of which were finalised during ECRI's December plenary and will be published soon.

## 3. Relations with civil society

- 39. Combating racism and intolerance can only be effective if the message filters down to society in general. Awareness-raising and a communication strategy are, therefore, essential. ECRI attaches great importance to this third part of its statutory activities.
- 40. ECRI participated in and contributed to events organised by several civil society organisations on various themes. On 2-3 March 2017, an ECRI member participated in the European Forum for Urban Security (EFUS) Seminar on Preventing and Countering Discriminatory Violence at the Local Level, held in Vienna. ECRI's Chair took part in a conference entitled "Tackling racism in the media" and society" organised by the United Kingdom's National Union of Journalists, held in London on 11 March 2017. On 6-8 July 2017, an member participated in the 6<sup>th</sup> biennial international ECRI Afroeuropeans: Black Cultures and Identities in Europe Conference. organised by the University of Tampere (Finland) and the international Afroeuropeans Cultures and Identities research network in Tampere. During its 74th plenary meeting, on 6 December 2017, ECRI held an exchange of views with Mr Jean-Frédéric Schaub, Director of Studies at the School of Advanced Studies in the Social Sciences in Paris (EHESS), on the concept of "race".

Organisation of national round tables in member states.

- 41. As an important tool to facilitate dialogue between state and non-state actors on issues related to the fight against racism and intolerance, ECRI organises national round tables following the publication of its country-specific monitoring reports. These events are addressed to various actors in civil society as well as to government officials in order to discuss jointly how best to promote the implementation of ECRI's recommendations.
- 42. ECRI organised a round table in Bratislava on 28 September 2017, in co-operation with the Slovak National Centre for Human Rights. This event brought together national and local authorities, academics, representatives of the judiciary and the law enforcement, international organisations and NGOs, to discuss the follow-up to the recommendations of ECRI's 2014 report on the Slovak Republic and its 2017 Conclusions, in particular the legislative and institutional framework for combating racism and racial discrimination and combating hate speech.
- 43. This round table brought more visibility to ECRI's work and ensured greater impact for its recommendations in the Slovak Republic.

# 4. Cooperation with Equality Bodies6 to combat racism and racial discrimination

44. Equality Bodies are strategic partners for ECRI. A seminar of Equality Bodies was held from 23-24 May 2017 in Strasbourg on the revision of ECRI General Policy Recommendation (GPR) No. 2: Equality bodies to combat racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism and intolerance at national level. The seminar discussed the draft revised GPR developed by ECRI's working group in order to include the experience and standpoints of the participants. The following topics were examined: the purpose and use of standards for equality bodies; the institutional architecture for equality bodies; the functions (promotion and prevention; victim support and litigation; adjudication) and the functioning (effectiveness, independence and accessibility) of equality bodies. The seminar was attended by the representatives

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The term "national specialised bodies" was updated with "equality bodies" in the revised version of GPR No. 2 which was published on 27 February 2018.

of member States' equality bodies including national Ombudspersons and national human rights institutions; members of ECRI; as well as, European and international intergovernmental organisations, NGOs and networks.

### 5. Other activities

- ECRI actively participated in events organised by national 45. and local authorities. On 28 April 2017, ECRI's Chair participated in a High Level Seminar on "Freedom of Religion in Europe: Achievements and Perspectives". This event was organised in Strasbourg by the Permanent Representation of the Republic of San Marino to the Council of Europe and the Council on International Law and Politics. An ECRI member participated at a seminar held in Helsinki on 6 June 2017 by the Finnish Foreign Ministry, concerning the state of human rights in Europe and the work of Council of Europe mechanisms defending human rights. ECRI's Chair also took part in the 3<sup>rd</sup> IPCAN (Independent Police Complaints Authorities' Network) Conference on the respect of fundamental freedoms on rights in the context of strengthening the fight against terrorism. This Conference was co-organised by the French Defender of Rights and the Council of Europe and took place on 14-15 September 2017 in Strasbourg, On 2-3 October 2017, ECRI took part in a meeting of the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA)-Committee on the Genocide of the Roma on the topic of anti-gypsyism. organised by the Austrian Federal Ministry of Education in Vienna.
- At its 72<sup>nd</sup> plenary meeting on 22-24 March 2017, ECRI held elections to a post of member of the Bureau. Mr Šarūnas Liekis (member in respect of Lithuania) was elected for two years. His term of office began on 23 March 2017. At its 73<sup>rd</sup> plenary meeting on 20-23 June, ECRI held elections to a post of 2nd Vice-Chair. Ms Maria Daniella Marouda (member in respect of Greece) was elected until 31 December 2017 (remaining term of office of the former 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chair) with immediate effect. ECRI decided unanimously that this period would not be counted as a year's term of office for the purpose of Article 6(2) of the Internal Rules of Procedure of ECRI. At its 74<sup>th</sup> plenary session on 5-8 December, ECRI held elections to the posts of Chair, two Vice-Chairs and two Bureau members. The following persons were elected: Mr Jean-Paul Lehners (member in respect of Luxembourg) was elected Chair for two years; Ms Maria Daniella Marouda (member in respect of Greece) was elected 1<sup>st</sup> Vice-Chair for one year: Ms Reetta Toivanen (member in respect

of Finland) was elected 2nd Vice-Chair for the same term. Mr Christian Ahlund (member in respect of Sweden) was elected Bureau member for two years. Mr Michael Farrell (member in respect of Ireland) was elected Bureau member for the same term. Their terms of office begin on 1 January 2018. At its 74th plenary on 5-8 December 2017, ECRI held elections to the posts of member of the working group on relations with civil society and specialised bodies. The following persons were elected for three years: Ms Nadejda Hriptievschi (member in respect of the Republic of Moldova); Ms Barbara John (member in respect of Germany); and Mr Andreas Paschalides (member in respect of Cyprus). Their terms of office begin on 1 January 2018. All the above elections were held in accordance with Articles 6 and 7 of ECRI's Internal Rules of Procedure.

## 6. Communication strategy

47. In order to reach out to a wider public, ECRI launched and distributed abridged versions of its GPRs. Efforts are being made to continue translating them into non-official languages of the Council of Europe. In view of the growing importance of social media, ECRI also opened a twitter account in 2017 and updated its database with a dedicated search engine "HUDOC-ECRI" that contains all ECRI's documents. Furthermore, activities such as the publication of ECRI's country reports and interim follow-up conclusions, country visits, its seminar with Equality Bodies and its round table in the Slovak Republic attracted considerable media attention. Approximately 500 press articles covering ECRI's work were identified over the year. ECRI will continue to take further steps to strengthen its communication strategy.

# Co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations

48. ECRI participated in and contributed to many events as part of its co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations.

# **Council of Europe**

- 49. In 2017, ECRI continued its co-operation with other Council of Europe monitoring bodies. From 20 to 24 November, an ECRI delegation carried out a monitoring visit to Latvia, in parallel with a visit by a delegation of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities.
- 50. The Parliamentary Assembly (PACE) and the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe (the Congress) are represented at ECRI's plenary meetings and contribute to its work. In 2017, ECRI participated in several PACE events. On 13 February, an ECRI member took part in a conference on "Online Hate, Conspiracy Theories and Declining Confidence in the Media" organised by the Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination and the No Hate Parliamentary Alliance, ECRI's Chair participated in an exchange of views with the Standing Committee of Parliamentary Assembly in Madrid on 10 March. 24 November, an ECRI member took part in a seminar on combating intolerance, discrimination and hatred - how to improve legislation and enforcement, organised by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe in co-operation with the Parliament of Albania in Tirana. ECRI also submitted comments on Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 2098 (2017) on Ending cyberdiscrimination and online hate.
- 51. On 6 July 2017, in collaboration with the Deputy Secretary General and the secretariat of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, ECRI contributed to the Jo Cox Committee on Intolerance, Xenophobia and Racism of the Italian Chamber of Deputies, which is in the process of drafting a white paper on hate speech.

- 52. An ECRI member took part in the No Hate Speech in Sport Workshop, organised by the Enlarged Partial Agreement on Sport (EPAS), in co-operation with the Youth Department of the Council of Europe and the Ministry of Civil Affairs of Bosnia-Herzegovina, held in Sarajevo on 21-22 November 2017. He presented and led an interactive discussion on the topic of legal and policy frameworks to combat hate speech and provide redress for targets of hate speech. An ECRI member also participated in the Intercultural Cities Milestone Event on urban policies for inclusive migrant integration and diversity advantage, organised by the Council of Europe and Intercultural Cities in Lisbon on 28-29 November 2017. ECRI's Chair took part in an exchange of views with the European Committee on Crime Problems (CDCP) on 29 November, during the latter's 73<sup>rd</sup> plenary session held in Strasbourg. This exchange of views involved presenting ECRI's GPR No. 15 on combatting hate speech. in order to stimulate a discussion on hate speech with a view to strengthening synergies and co-operation in areas of common concern to ECRI and the CDPC.
- 53. In general, ECRI is regularly updated on the work of other Council of Europe bodies dealing with issues related to racism and intolerance. ECRI's Secretariat provides these bodies with information on ECRI's activities.

### **United Nations**

Universal Periodic Review (UPR)

54. In 2017, ECRI contributed to the 28<sup>th</sup>, 29<sup>th</sup> and 30th sessions of the Universal Periodical Review with its country reports and interim follow up conclusions.

#### **UN Conventions**

- 55. On 21 June 2017, ECRI held an exchange of views with Ms Anastasia Crickley, Chair of the UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination. Among other things, the possibility of increased co-operation between ECRI and CERD was discussed.
- 56. ECRI reports make regular reference to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD). ECRI also calls upon states that have not yet made a declaration under Article 14 of ICERD, enabling individuals and

groups of individuals to file petitions before the UN Committee for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD), to do so.

Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)

ECRI is regularly invited to participate in various meetings organised by the OHCHR and to submit contributions based on its monitoring and thematic work. Similarly OHCHR staff members are regularly invited to ECRI's events. In co-operation with the Council of Europe's Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law, ECRI participated in the 9th OHCHR-CoE Coordination Meeting, held on 31 January 2017 in Strasbourg, which focused on migration. An ECRI member participated in the 20th Session of the Working Group of Experts on People of African Descent, held on 3-7 April 2017 in Geneva and entitled "Leaving no one behind, people of African descent and the Sustainable Development Goals". On 16 June 2017, ECRI took part in a round table on the principles and guidelines on the human rights protection of migrants in vulnerable situations, organised jointly by the OHCHR and the Platform for International Co-operation on Undocumented Migrants (PICUM). On 16 October 2017, ECRI participated in the 15th session of the Intergovernmental Working Group on the Effective Implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action, held in Geneva.

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)

58. ECRI has a close working relationship with UNHCR, facilitated by the UNHCR Representation to the European Institutions in Strasbourg. ECRI regularly receives input from UNHCR concerning its country visits, round tables and various legal issues.

# Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE)

- 59. ECRI and the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) continued to involve each other in their conferences and meetings. OSCE/ODIHR is systematically invited to and attends ECRI's national round tables and ECRI contributes regularly to OSCE/ODIHR meetings.
- 60. There were several highlights of this regular co-operation in 2017. On 15 May, ECRI attended a launch event held at the Parliamentary Society of the German Bundestag in Berlin, of

.....

ODHIR's Practical guide on understanding anti-semitic hate crimes and addressing the security needs of Jewish communities. On 22 November, an ECRI member participated in the OSCE Conference on "Preventing and Countering Hate Crimes against Christians and Members of Other Religious Groups – Perspectives from the OSCE and Beyond", which took place in Yerevan. ECRI also took part in an OSCE Mission Conference entitled "Western Balkans Regional Conference – Protect and respect – safeguarding human rights" held in Podgorica on 23-24 November. The Conference discussed issues such as hate speech, hate crime and self-regulation in the media, including social media.

61. OSCE/ODIHR and ECRI continue to attach particular importance to the fight against hate crime, an area of common interest also in the context of ECRI's fifth monitoring cycle, which focuses inter alia on hate speech and racist violence. The two bodies co-operate and benefit from each other's expertise and initiatives in ECRI's country reports and this area: General Recommendations and ODIHR's compilation of data in annual reports entitled Hate Crimes in the OSCE Region - Incidents and Responses.

# **European Union**

## European Commission

62. The Directorate of Equality and Union Citizenship of the Directorate-General (DG) Justice and Consumers of the European Commission and ECRI's Secretariat keep each other informed of important developments in their work and exchange information on subjects of common interest. On 17 May 2017, ECRI took part in a meeting with the head of the Council of Europe's Anti-Discrimination Department and the head of the Non-discrimination and Roma coordination at Directorate of Equality and Union Citizenship of DG Justice and Consumers, to discuss possible co-operation programmes. ECRI attended the third meeting organised by the European Commission of the EU High Level Group on combating racism, xenophobia and other forms of intolerance, held in Brussels on 31 May-1 June 2017, which discussed countering hate speech online; ensuring justice for victims of hate crime and hate speech and methodologies for recording and collecting data on hate crime.

### Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA)

63. Cooperation between ECRI and FRA continued in 2017 ECRI's reports make regular reference to FRA's work. ECRI continued to provide inputs to the preparation of FRA's annual report and FRA provided inputs to the preparation of ECRI's country reports. Throughout the year ECRI participated actively in several events organised by FRA, such as the second (26 April) and third (6 October) meetings of the sub-group on methodologies for recording and collecting data on hate crimes.

# **Organization of American States**

- 64. On 22 March 2017, ECRI held an exchange of views with Ms Betilde Muňoz-Pogossian, Director of the Department of Social Inclusion (DIS), Secretariat for Access to Rights and Equality, Organization of American States.
- On 6-8 November 2017, the Chair of ECRI, together with the Head of the Anti-Discrimination Department of the Council of Europe. took part in a fruitful exchange with the Permanent Council of the Organization of American States in Washington D.C. They also met with the Assistant Secretary General of the OAS, Mr Nestor Mendez and officials from the World Bank; the U.S. Department of State; U.S. civil rights organisations. ECRI's Chair gave a lecture at the American University and met with the Chair of the Anti-Racist Research and Policy Centre and the Co-Director of the Academy on Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law. The exchange contributed to preparatory work for the setting up of an Inter-American Committee for the Prevention and Elimination of Racism. Racial Discrimination and All Forms of Discrimination Intolerance and reinforced co-operation, synergies and the sharing of expertise with the OAS, the World Bank, the U.S. Department of State and American civil society organisations.

### Joint statement

66. ECRI, FRA and the OSCE/ODIHR issued a joint statement on 21 March 2017 to mark the international day for the elimination of racial discrimination. This statement stressed that it is the responsibility of all, and political leaders in particular, to counter intolerant discourse and hate speech, and to ensure their root causes are addressed through education. It also called on governments and state authorities to promote inclusion and mutual



# Appendix I – Membership of ECRI<sup>7</sup>

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Mr Christian ÅHLUND	Sweden	24 May 2020
Mr Jovan ANANIEV	"the former Yugoslav Republic of	5 February 2018
Mr Gabriel BALAYAN	Armenia	7 July 2020
Ms Raluca BESTELIU	Romania	31 December 2017
Mr Sinisa BJEKOVIC	Montenegro	9 December 2018
Mr Thomas BÜCHEL	Liechtenstein	27 May 2019
Mr Patrice DAVOST	Monaco	6 December 2020
Mr Régis de GOUTTES	France	16 September 2019
Ms María ELOSEGUI ITXASO	Spain	31 December 2017
Mr Vitaliano ESPOSITO	Italy	31 December 2017
Mr Michael FARRELL	Ireland	29 November 2021

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> All tables in this appendix reflect the situation on 31 December 2017.

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Mr Gilberto FELICI	San Marino	11 June 2018
Mr Fernando FERREIRA RAMOS	Portugal	31 December 2017
Mr Saša GAJIN	Serbia	6 November 2022
Ms Domenica GHIDEI BIIDU	Netherlands	7 October 2020
Ms Nadejda HRIPTIEVSCHI	Moldova	15 September 2018
Ms Vasilika HYSI	Albania	31 December 2017
Mr Rovshan ISMAYILOV	Azerbaijan	31 December 2017
Mr Dalibor JÍLEK	Czech Republic	31 December 2017
Ms Barbara JOHN	Germany	31 December 2017
Mr Imre JUHÁSZ	Hungary	31 December 2017
Ms Anhelita KAMENSKA	Latvia	25 October 2021
Ms Elżbieta KARSKA	Poland	2 May 2022
Mr Baldur KRISTJÁNSSON	Iceland	31 December 2017

.....

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Ms Mojca KUCLER DOLINAR	Slovenia	31 December 2017
Mr Volodymyr KULYK	Ukraine	10 December 2018
Mr Gün KUT	Turkey	31 December 2017
Ms Renee LAIVIERA	Malta	17 November 2019
Mr Jean-Paul LEHNERS	Luxembourg	8 February 2021
Mr Šarūnas LIEKIS	Lithuania	31 December 2017
Ms Ülle MADISE	Estonia	31 December 2017
Ms Maria Daniella MAROUDA	Greece	4 November 2020
Mr Andreas PASCHALIDES	Cyprus	31 December 2017
Mr Predrag RAOSAVLJEVIC	Bosnia and Herzegovina	10 December 2018
Mr Jacint RIBERAYGUA CAELLES	Andorra	26 September 2021
Mr François SANT'ANGELO	Belgium	31 December 2017
Mr Gerald SCHÖPFER	Austria	27 February 2020

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Ms Tena ŠIMONOVIĆ EINWALTER	Croatia	1 July 2019
Ms Eva SMITH ASMUSSEN	Denmark	31 December 2017
Mr Sergey SOKOLOVSKIY	Russian Federation	31 December 2017
Mr Aslak SYSE	Norway	31 December 2017
Mr Daniel THÜRER	Switzerland	31 December 2018
Ms Reetta TOIVANEN	Finland	1 July 2019
Mr George TUGUSHI	Georgia	31 December 2017
Mr Michal VAŠEČKA	Slovakia	31 December 2017
Mr Blagoy VIDIN	Bulgaria	31 December 2017
Mr Michael WHINE	United Kingdom	17 September 2018

.....

# **Deputies to ECRI members**

Name	Deputy in respect of	Term of office expires
Ms Doris ANGST	Switzerland	31 December 2018
Ms Cecilia CARDOGNA	San Marino	11 June 2018
Mr Patrick CHARLIER	Belgium	31 December 2017
Mr Stanislav DANIEL	Slovakia	31 December 2017
Ms Carolina HADJIATHANASIOU-	Cyprus	31 December 2017
Ms Dženana HADŽIOMEROVIĆ	Bosnia and Herzegovina	10 December 2018
Ms Ketevan KHUTSISHVILI	Georgia	31 December 2017
Ms Renée KOERING- JOULIN	France	16 September 2019
Mr Oleksiy KRESIN	Ukraine	10 December 2018
Mr Paul Aarre LAPPALAINEN	Sweden	24 May 2020
Mr Alexis MARQUET	Monaco	6 December 2020
Ms Carmen QUESADA ALCALÁ	Spain	31 December 2017
Ms Anna RASTAS	Finland	1 July 2019
Ms Fabienne ROSSLER	Luxembourg	8 February 2021

### **Observers to ECRI**

### Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

Mr Titus CORLĂŢEAN Mr Damien THIÉRY Mr Suat ÖNAL

# Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe

Mr Varinder Singh BOLA

### Holy See

Mr Jean-Pierre MACHELON

### **European Commission**

Ms Linda Maria RAVO

### Mexico

Ms Alexandra HAAS PACIUC

### ECRI's Bureau

Mr Christian AHLUND Chair member in respect of Sweden

Mr Jean-Paul LEHNERS Vice-Chair member in respect of Luxembourg

Ms Maria Daniella MAROUDA Vice-Chair member in respect of Greece

Mr Siniša BJEKOVIC Bureau member member in respect of Montenegro

Ms Barbara JOHN Bureau member member in respect of Germany

Mr Šarūnas LIEKIS Bureau member member in respect of Lithuania

Mr Daniel THÜRER Bureau member member in respect of Switzerland

# Appendix II - Secretariat of ECRI®

Ms Michèle AKIP, Executive Secretary to ECRI

Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 23 46

Mr Stefano VALENTI, External Relations Officer

Tel: +33 (0) 3 90 21 43 28

Ms Camilla TESSENYI, Lawyer

Tel: + 33 (0) 3 88 41 30 29

Mr Thobias BERGMANN, Programme Adviser

Tel: +33 (0) 3 90 21 46 19

Mr Wolfram BECHTEL, Lawyer

Tel: + 33 (0) 3 90 21 58 44

Ms Zeynep USAL KANZLER, Lawyer

Tel.: +33 (0) 3 90 21 63 63

Mr Denis ROTH-FICHET, Lawyer

Tel: +33 (0) 3 90 21 56 27

Ms Sophie KURT, Researcher/Project Officer

Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 35 28

Ms Paula ECK-WALTERS, Documentalist

Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 33 99

Ms Sylvia LEHMANN, Assistant

Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 29 64

Ms Maya RASMUSSEN, Assistant

Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 24 02

<sup>8</sup> This appendix reflects the situation on 31 December 2017.

#### Secretariat's address

Directorate General II - Democracy Directorate of Democratic Governance and Anti-Discrimination Council of Europe 67075 STRASBOURG CEDEX France

E-mail Secretariat: ecri@coe.int

\_\_\_\_\_

# Appendix III - Meetings held by ECRI in 2017

#### Plenary sessions

- 22-24 March 2017
- 20-23 June 2017
- 5-8 December 2017

# Meetings of the Working Group on relations with civil society and equality bodies

- 21 March 2017
- 19 June 2017
- 16 October 2017
- 4 December 2017

# Meetings of the Working Group on the revision of GPR No.2

- 16-17 January 2017
- 20-21 March 2017
- 22-24 May 2017
- 19 June 2017
- 6 December 2017

#### National round table

Slovak Republic: 28 September 2017

Seminar with Equality Bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination on "Revision of ECRI General Policy Recommendation (GPR) N°2: Specialised bodies to combat racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism and intolerance at national level"

• 23-24 May 2017

#### **Bureau meetings**

- 21 March 2017
- 19 June 2017
- 6 October 2017
- 4 December 2017

#### **Meetings of CBC Working Groups**

#### Preparation of contact visits:

Croatia: 3 February 2017
Latvia: 23 June 2017
Liechtenstein: 23 June 2017
Malta: 21 March 2017
Republic of Moldova: 20 June 2017
Portugal: 19 June 2017
Russian Federation: 8 December 2017

#### Amendments:

Croatia: 5 December 2017 Liechtenstein: 5 December 2017 Malta: 5 December 2017 22 March 2017 Montenegro: San Marino: 21 June 2017 Spain: 20 June 2017 Sweden: 20 June 2017 Ukraine: 22 March 2017

#### Interim follow-up:

Albania: 8 December 2017 Austria: 7 December 2017 • Czech Republic: 7 December 2017 Estonia: 8 December 2017 • Greece: 21 June 2017 8 December 2017 Hungary: Norway: 22 June 2017 • Poland: 5 December 2017 Slovenia: 23 March 2017

#### **Contact Visits**

• Croatia: 24-28 April 2017

• Latvia: 20-24 November 2017

• Malta: 2-5 May 2017

Republic of Moldova:
 16-20 October 2017

• Portugal: 12-17 November 2017

• San Marino: 12-17 November 2017

Spain: 19-24 February 2017Sweden: 19-24 February 2017

# Appendix IV - List of publications<sup>9</sup>

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.1: Combating racism, xenophobia antisemitism and intolerance (Strasbourg, 4 October 1996)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.2: Specialised bodies to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at national level (Strasbourg, 13 June 1997)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.3: combating racism and intolerance against Roma/Gypsies (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.4: National surveys on the experience and perception of discrimination and racism from the point of view of potential victims (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.5: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims (Strasbourg, 27 April 2000)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.6: Combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and antisemitic material via the Internet (Strasbourg, 15 December 2000)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.7: National legislation to combat racism and racial discrimination (Strasbourg, 13 December 2002)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.8: Combating racism while fighting terrorism (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.9: The fight against antisemitism (Strasbourg, 9 September 2004)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.10: Combating racism and racial discrimination in and through school education (Strasbourg, 21 March 2007)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Publications that are out of date no longer figure on this list.

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.11: Combating racism and racial discrimination in policing (Strasbourg, 4 October 2007)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.12: Combating racism and racial discrimination in the field of sport (Strasbourg, 19 March 2009)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.13: Combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma (Strasbourg, 19 September 2011)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.14: Combating racism and racial discrimination in employment (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.15: Combating Hate Speech (Strasbourg, 21 March 2016)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.16: Safeguarding irregularly present migrants from discrimination (Strasbourg, 10 May 2016)
- ECRI's country-by-country approach:

### → First round:

- Volume I (Strasbourg, September 1997)
- Volume II (Strasbourg, March 1998)
- Volume III (Strasbourg, 15 June 1998)
- Volume IV (Strasbourg, 26 January 1999)
- Volume V (Strasbourg, 13 March 1999)
- Volume VI (Strasbourg, 24 May 1999)
- Volume VII (Strasbourg, 9 November 1999)

## → Second round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)

- Belgium (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 3 March 2001)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- France (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- The Netherlands (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 4 November 2002)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 4 November 2003)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)

 Compilation of second round reports (Strasbourg, February 2004)

#### → Third round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- France (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Netherland (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)

- San Marino (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)

#### → Fourth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 9 February 2011)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- France (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
   Ireland (Strasbourg, 19 February 2014)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 19 February 2014)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 19 February 2014)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 13 September 2011)

- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Montenegro (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Netherlands (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)

## → Follow-up recommendations fourth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- France (Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)

- Georgia (Strasbourg, 15 October 2013)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)
- Moldova (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Montenegro (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Netherlands (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 19 September 2017)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)

#### Fifth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 13 October 2015)

- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 13 October 2015)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 13 October 2015)
- France (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Montenegro (Strasbourg, 19 September 2017)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 19 September 2017)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)

# → Follow-up recommendations fifth round:

- Belgium (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Slovak Republic (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)

- Proceedings of the Seminar "Combating racism while respecting freedom of expression", 16 -17 November 2006 (Strasbourg, July 2007)
- "Ethnic" statistics and data protection in the Council of Europe countries, by Patrick Simon, *Institut National d'Etudes* Démographiques (Strasbourg, November 2007)
- "Cooperation for effectiveness: Local authorities and national specialised bodies combating racism and intolerance" ECRI study by Niall Crowley (Strasbourg, May 2015)
- "National Specialised Bodies: Effective implementation of their advisory function" ECRI study by Niall Crowley (Strasbourg, December 2016)